

2010 JSGMESB Scoring Guidance

This guidance provides criteria to use in scoring applicants. The purpose of the score sheet is to provide a quantitative basis for ranking applicants. It is designed to give increasing weight to performance as an individual progresses through the phases of medical education and utilization tours.

APPLICANT SCORE SHEET

1. **Preclinical Years of Medical School:** Score using the medical school transcript and Dean's Letter. The expectation is that the top 20-25% of individuals will be considered outstanding and score 2 points, and the majority of the remainder will be considered good and score 1 point. Include USMLE Step 1 or COMLEX in evaluation.
2. **Clinical Years of Medical School:** Score using the medical school transcript and Dean's letter. The expectation is that 20-25% will be considered outstanding and score 3 points; 20-25% evaluated as good and score 2 points, while the majority of the remainder considered acceptable with a score of 1 point. If available, include USMLE Step 2 or COMLEX.
3. **Internship (PGY-1):** Score using interview, letters of recommendation, and performance reports, e.g. Officer Evaluation Reports (OER), Officer Performance Reports (OPR), and Fitness Reports (FITREP) as available. The expectation is that only the top 20-25% will be scored outstanding (5 points). The rest will rank in the excellent (4 points), good (3 points), and acceptable (2 points) categories. The maximum possible score for applicants currently in Internships (PGY-1) is good (3 points) since there is limited data available on their performance. Those who have completed an internship (PGY-1 year) should include USMLE Step 3/COMLEX, if available.
4. **Residency:** Score using interview, letters of recommendation, and performance reports, e.g. OERs, OPRs, and FITREPs, as available. The maximum score possible for those who have completed residency and are in a utilization tour and applying for fellowship training is outstanding (10 points). The expectation is that only the top 20 - 25% will be scored outstanding. The maximum possible score for applicants currently in residency who are applying for fellowship training is good (7 points). **Note:** This item is only to be scored for residency-trained individuals who are applying for fellowship. Individuals who are applying for a second residency should receive no score in this category. The only exception is for Navy applicants applying for residency training in aerospace medicine, who must receive a score in this category.
5. **Post-Internship Operational/Utilization Tour (OP/UT):** Score using military performance reports, e.g. OERs, OPRs or FITREPs, and letters of recommendation/command endorsements as appropriate. It is recognized that most OERs/OPRs/FITREPs and letters will be highly complimentary to the applicant; however, every effort should be made to identify the truly outstanding applicants in this item. If the applicant has served in more than one assignment in this category, the score should reflect a composite of the performance data. If the applicant has been in initial utilization tour for less than 9 months at the time of the board, maximal score is 3 (good) since there is limited data available on their performance.
6. **Potential for Successful Practice as Specialist and Career Officer:** This should reflect the overall impression of the applicant based upon the OERs/OPRs/FITREPs, interview and letters of recommendation/command endorsement as appropriate. Reserve the outstanding category (5 points) for those individuals for whom there is objective evidence of truly exceptional potential. Any score less than 3 needs to be supported by documentation within the record.
7. **Panel Member Score:** Scores should fall within the following parameters.
 - Maximum possible scores:**
 - 30 for a residency-trained staff physician who has served a utilization tour, applying for fellowship.
 - 27 for a current resident who served as a general medical officer, applying for fellowship
 - 22 for a current resident who did not serve as a GMO/flight surgeon, applying for fellowship
 - 20 for an applicant for residency who has served a tour as a GMO/flight surgeon or for 2nd residency candidates.
 - 13 for a current intern (PGY-1)
 - Minimum scores for operational/utilization (non-training status) applicants unless there is documentation of adverse evaluations, events, or program director comments in the record:**
 - 15 for an operational/utilization applicant applying for fellowship
 - 10 for an operational/utilization applicant applying for residency

COMPOSITE SCORE SHEET

1. **Panel Member Scores:** A single panel member score from each Service will be entered for each applicant.

2. **Split Scores:** A split score is an excessive point spread between individual member scores for the same applicant. Split scores vary depending on the category of the applicant as follows:

- a. Student - 3 points
- b. Current intern - 4 points
- c. GMO applicants - 5 points
- d. Current residents - 6 points
- e. Staff (completed residency) - 8 points

The chair must identify split scores and ensure that the individual scoring members discuss the record to address their interpretations of the data. The individual scorers may change their scores after the discussion but are under no obligation to do so. The chair must be notified of the outcome of the discussion.

3. **Composite Score:** This is the sum of the individual selection panel members' scores.

4. **Bonus Points:** Additional points may be earned by an applicant for research and/or prior military service. Each of the three scoring members may make a recommendation to the Chair on bonus points for the records they score. The chair, however, is responsible for reviewing the recommendations and assigning the points. The maximum points which can be awarded by the chair are 4 for research and 2 for prior military service, except as noted below for Air Force medical students.

- a. **Research** - A score should be assigned according to the following general parameters:
 - 4 points - Multiple publications in peer reviewed journals
 - 3 points - A single publication in a peer reviewed journal
 - 2 points - Multiple publications in in-house journals or multiple poster presentations
 - 1 point - Single publication in in-house journal or poster presentation

A bonus of 1 point may be awarded for research performed under difficult conditions, such as internship, residency (not counting dedicated research time during training) and operational tours, as long as the total bonus points for research do not exceed 4. Similarly, panels may elect not to award points for research, particularly if it was a graduation or residency completion requirement.

Selection Panels may modify the above guidelines as long as the scoring is consistent across the entire applicant pool for the specialty. Except as noted, the maximum number of total points that may be awarded for research endeavors is 4. **Note:** For Air Force students, the max research score is 2.

b. **Prior Military Service** - This is a bonus score applied once for non-Medical Corps active duty of 2 years or longer according to the following parameters:

- 2 points – Either commissioned or enlisted service in a medical capacity, e.g., Nurse Corps, Dental Corps, Medical Service Corps or enlisted Hospital Corpsman/Medic.
- 1 point – Either commissioned or enlisted service in a non-medical capacity.

If an individual has both types of experience, the maximum score in this category is still 2 points. Time spent as a USUHS student, service academy or NROTC/ROTC midshipman/cadet does not qualify for this bonus. **Note:** For Air Force students, the max prior military service score is 1.

5. **Total Score:** The composite score plus any bonus points equals the Total Score. The Total Score will determine applicant order on the order of merit lists.

**2010 JOINT SERVICE
GRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION SELECTION BOARD**

APPLICANT SCORE SHEET

Applicant Name: _____

SSN: _____

Specialty: _____

Service: _____

Applicant Status: Student

2A – USUHS

2H – HPSP

2R – ROTC/Ed Delay

COMMENTS:

RATE THE APPLICANTS PERFORMANCE:

See the 2010 JSGMESB Scoring Guidance for criteria to use and circle one score for each category.

	Outstanding	Excellent	Good	Acceptable	Marginal	Un-satisfactory
1. Pre-Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 1/COMLEX)	2		1			0
2. Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 2/COMLEX)	3		2	1		0
3. Internship (USMLE Step 3/COMLEX)						
4. Residency (Fellowship applicants ONLY)						
5. Post-Internship Operational/Utilization Tour (OP/UT)						
6. Potential for successful practice as specialist and career officer	5	4	3	2	1	0
7. Active Duty Tour Points (Air Force Medical Students Only)			3	2	1	0

PANEL MEMBER SCORE
(13 points maximum)

Panel Member Signature
AIR FORCE

Date

Printed Name

2010 JOINT SERVICE GRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION SELECTION BOARD

APPLICANT SCORE SHEET

Applicant Name: _____

SSN: _____

Specialty: _____

Service: _____

Applicant Status: Resident Applicant for Fellowship
(No Operational or Utilization Tour)

COMMENTS:

RATE THE APPLICANTS PERFORMANCE:

See the 2010 JSGMESB Scoring Guidance for criteria to use and circle one score for each category.

	Outstanding	Excellent	Good	Acceptable	Marginal	Un-satisfactory				
1. Pre-Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 1/COMLEX)	2		1			0				
2. Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 2/COMLEX)	3		2	1		0				
3. Internship (USMLE Step 3/COMLEX) Maximum score of 3 for current interns	5	4	3	2	1	0				
4. Residency (Fellowship applicants ONLY) Maximum score of 7 for current residents			7	6	5	4	3	2	1	0
5. Post-Residency/ Post-Internship Operational/Utilization Tour (OP/UT)										
6. Potential for successful practice as specialist and career officer	5	4	3	2	1	0				

PANEL MEMBER SCORE
(22 points maximum)

Recommended
Bonus Points
To Panel Chair:

Prior Service
Research

Panel Member Signature
(CIRCLE ONE: ARMY AIR FORCE NAVY)

Date

Printed Name

2010 JOINT SERVICE GRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION SELECTION BOARD

APPLICANT SCORE SHEET

Applicant Name: _____

SSN: _____

Specialty: _____

Service: _____

Applicant Status: Field Applicant for Fellowship

COMMENTS:

RATE THE APPLICANTS PERFORMANCE:

See the 2010 JSGMESB Scoring Guidance for criteria to use and circle one score for each category.

	Outstanding	Excellent	Good	Acceptable	Marginal	Un-satisfactory
1. Pre-Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 1/COMLEX)	2		1			0
2. Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 2/COMLEX)	3		2	1		0
3. Internship (USMLE Step 3/COMLEX) Maximum score of 3 for current interns	5	4	3	2	1	0
4. Residency (Fellowship applicants ONLY) Maximum score of 7 for current residents	10	9 8	7 6 5	4 3	2 1	0
5. Post Residency/Post-Internship Operational/Utilization Tour (OP/UT)	5	4	3	2	1	0
6. Potential for successful practice as specialist and career officer	5	4	3	2	1	0

PANEL MEMBER SCORE
(30 points maximum)

Recommended
Bonus Points
To Panel Chair:

Prior Service
Research

Panel Member Signature
(CIRCLE ONE: ARMY AIR FORCE NAVY)

Date

Printed Name

2010 JOINT SERVICE GRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION SELECTION BOARD

APPLICANT SCORE SHEET

Applicant Name: _____

SSN: _____

Specialty: _____

Service: _____

Applicant Status: Intern Applicant for Residency

COMMENTS:

RATE THE APPLICANTS PERFORMANCE:

See the 2010 JSGMESB Scoring Guidance for criteria to use and circle one score for each category.

	Outstanding	Excellent	Good	Acceptable	Marginal	Un-satisfactory
1. Pre-Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 1/COMLEX)	2		1			0
2. Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 2/COMLEX)	3		2	1		0
3. Internship (USMLE Step 3/COMLEX) Maximum score of 3 for current interns			3	2	1	0
4. Residency (Fellowship applicants ONLY) Maximum score of 7 for current residents						
5. Post Residency/Post-Internship Operational/Utilization Tour (OP/UT)						
6. Potential for successful practice as specialist and career officer	5	4	3	2	1	0

PANEL MEMBER SCORE
(13 points maximum)

Recommended
Bonus Points
To Panel Chair:

Prior Service

Research

Panel Member Signature
(CIRCLE ONE: ARMY AIR FORCE NAVY)

Date

Printed Name

**2010 JOINT SERVICE
GRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION SELECTION BOARD**

APPLICANT SCORE SHEET

Applicant Name: _____

SSN: _____

Specialty: _____

Service: _____

Applicant Status: Field Applicant for Residency

COMMENTS:

RATE THE APPLICANTS PERFORMANCE:

See the 2010 JSGMESB Scoring Guidance for criteria to use and circle one score for each category.

	Outstanding	Excellent	Good	Acceptable	Marginal	Un-satisfactory
1. Pre-Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 1/COMLEX)	2		1			0
2. Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 2/COMLEX)	3		2	1		0
3. Internship (USMLE Step 3/COMLEX) Maximum score of 3 for current interns	5	4	3	2	1	0
4. Residency (Fellowship applicants ONLY) Maximum score of 7 for current residents						
5. Post-Residency/Post-Internship Operational/Utilization Tour (OP/UT)	5	4	3	2	1	0
6. Potential for successful practice as specialist and career officer	5	4	3	2	1	0

PANEL MEMBER SCORE
(20 points maximum)

Recommended
Bonus Points
to Panel Chair:

Prior Service
Research

Panel Member Signature
(CIRCLE ONE: ARMY AIR FORCE NAVY)

Date

Printed Name

2010 JOINT SERVICE GRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION SELECTION BOARD

APPLICANT SCORE SHEET

Applicant Name: _____

SSN: _____

Specialty: _____

Service: _____

Applicant Status: Resident Applicant for Fellowship
w/previous GMO/Operational Tour

COMMENTS:

RATE THE APPLICANTS PERFORMANCE:

See the 2010 JSGMESB Scoring Guidance for criteria to use and circle one score for each category.

	Outstanding	Excellent	Good	Acceptable	Marginal	Un-satisfactory				
1. Pre-Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 1/COMLEX)	2		1			0				
2. Clinical Years of Medical School (Including USMLE Step 2/COMLEX)	3		2	1		0				
3. Internship (USMLE Step 3/COMLEX) Maximum score of 3 for current interns	5	4	3	2	1	0				
4. Residency (Fellowship applicants ONLY) Maximum score of 7 for current residents			7	6	5	4	3	2	1	0
5. Post-Residency/Post-Internship Operational/Utilization Tour (OP/UT)	5	4	3	2	1	0				
6. Potential for successful practice as specialist and career officer	5	4	3	2	1	0				

PANEL MEMBER SCORE
(27 points maximum)

**Recommended
Bonus Points
to Panel Chair:**

Prior Service

Research

Panel Member Signature
(CIRCLE ONE: ARMY AIR FORCE NAVY)

Date

Printed Name